

On the Fossil and Recent Faunæ of the Oregon desert, E. D. Cope.

Biographical Memoir of the late Professor S. S. Haldeman, J. P. Lesley.

Newly determined line of the Terminal Moraine across Pennsylvania, J. P. Lesley.

An Elementary Treatise on Electricity, by JAMES CLERK MAXWELL, M.A.; edited by WILLIAM GARNETT, M.A. 208 pp. 8vo, with 6 plates. Oxford, 1881. (Clarendon Press.)

Tables of Qualitative Analysis, arranged by H. G. MADAN, M.A., F.C.S. 20 pp. 4to. Oxford, 1881. (Clarendon Press.)

#### OBITUARY.

MR. ROBERT MALLET, F.R.S., long known for his valuable memoirs on earthquakes and volcanoes, died on the fifth of November, at the age of seventy-one. Mr. Mallett was born in Dublin on June 3, 1810. He qualified himself early in life as an engineer, and for a number of years was actively engaged in the work of his profession. His taste for scientific study led him also to spend much time in study and research, and in 1846 his first paper on earthquake phenomena was published in the Philosophical Magazine. Two years later he published, in the Transactions of the Royal Irish Academy, a paper containing an exposition of his views on wave-movement in earthquakes, and from that time until the end of his life his scientific activity did not cease, although during his later years he was afflicted with almost total blindness. Altogether he was the author of more than seventy memoirs, besides several separately published works. These memoirs relate for the most part to the phenomena of earthquakes and volcanoes, and will always be of the greatest value to the student of these subjects; in fact the subjects may be said to have been, in many respects, developed by him. Among the more important of his scientific contributions may be mentioned the Earthquake Catalogue completed, with the aid of his son (Professor J. W. Mallet, of Virginia), in 1858; also the memoir containing his observations on the Neapolitan earthquake published in two volumes, in 1862, in which for the first time he laid down the method of studying such phenomena; and still again the paper on Volcanic Energy published in the Transactions of the Royal Society in 1872. The last memoir mentioned contains the results of a series of careful experiments and of calculations based upon them, on the amount of heat produced by the crushing of different kinds of rocks; the conclusions reached, in regard to the probable mechanical source of much of the heat involved in metamorphic action and volcanic phenomena, have exerted a wide influence, and their importance can hardly be overestimated.

(The facts contained in this notice are mostly taken from *Nature* of December 1.)

## APPENDIX.

ART. VII.—*Classification of the Dinosauria*; by Professor O. C. MARSH.\*

IN the May number of the American Journal of Science, (page 423), I presented an outline of a classification of the Jurassic Dinosaurian Reptiles of this country which I had personally examined. The series then investigated is deposited in the Museum of Yale College, and consists of several hundred individuals, many of them well preserved, and representing numerous genera and species. To ascertain how far the classification proposed would apply to the material gathered from wider fields, I have since examined various Dinosaurian remains from other formations of this country, and likewise, during the past summer, have visited most of the museums of Europe that contain important specimens of this group. Although the investigation is not yet completed, I have thought the results already attained of sufficient interest to present to the Academy at this time.

In previous classifications, which were based upon very limited material compared with what is now available, the Dinosaurs were very generally regarded as an order. Various characters were assigned to the group by von Meyer, who applied to it the term *Pachypoda*; by Owen, who subsequently gave the name *Dinosauria*, now in general use; and also by Huxley, who more recently proposed the name *Ornithoscelida*, and who first appreciated the great importance of the group, and the close relation it bears to Birds. The researches of Leidy and Cope in this country, and Hulke, Seeley, and others in Europe, have likewise added much to our knowledge of the subject.

An examination of any considerable portion of the Dinosaurian remains now known will make it evident to any one familiar with reptiles, recent or extinct, that this group should be

\*Read before the National Academy of Sciences, at the Philadelphia meeting, November 14, 1881.

regarded, not as an order, but as a sub-class, and this rank is given it in the present communication. The great number of subordinate divisions in the group, and the remarkable diversity among those already discovered indicate that many new forms will yet be found. Even among those now known, there is a much greater difference in size and in osseous structure than in any other sub-class of vertebrates, with the single exception of the placental Mammals. Compared with the Marsupials, living and extinct, the *Dinosauria* show an equal diversity of structure, and variations in size from by far the largest land animals known—fifty or sixty feet long, down to some of the smallest, a few inches only in length.

According to present evidence, the Dinosaurs were confined entirely to the Mesozoic age. They were abundant in the Triassic, culminated in the Jurassic, and continued in diminishing numbers to the end of the Cretaceous period, when they became extinct. The great variety of forms that flourished in the Triassic render it more than probable that some members of the group existed in the Permian period, and their remains may be brought to light at any time.

The Triassic Dinosaurs, although so very numerous, are known to-day mainly from footprints and fragmentary osseous remains. Not more than half a dozen skeletons, at all complete, have been secured from deposits of this period; hence, many of the remains described cannot at present be referred to their appropriate divisions in the group.

From the Jurassic period, however, during which Dinosaurian reptiles reached their zenith in size and numbers, representatives of no less than four well-marked orders are now so well known that different families and genera can be very accurately determined, and almost the entire osseous structure of typical examples, at least, be made out with certainty. The main difficulty at present with the Jurassic Dinosaurs is in ascertaining the affinities of the diminutive forms which appear to approach Birds so closely. These forms were not rare, but their remains hitherto found are mostly fragmentary, and can with difficulty be distinguished from those of Birds, which occur in the same beds. Future discoveries will, without doubt, throw much light upon this point.

Comparatively little is yet known of Cretaceous Dinosaurs, although many have been described from incomplete specimens. All of these appear to have been of large size, but much inferior in this respect to the gigantic forms of the previous period. The remains best preserved show that, before extinction, some members of the group became quite highly specialized.

Regarding the Dinosaurs as a sub-class of the REPTILIA, the forms best known at present may be classified as follows:

#### SUB-CLASS DINOSAURIA.

Premaxillary bones separate; upper and lower temporal arches; rami of lower jaw united in front by cartilage only; no teeth on palate. Neural arches of vertebræ united to centra by suture; cervical vertebræ numerous; sacral vertebræ coössi-fied. Cervical ribs united to vertebræ by suture or ankylosis; thoracic ribs double-headed. Pelvic bones separate from each other, and from sacrum; ilium prolonged in front of acetabulum; acetabulum formed in part by pubis; ischia meet distally on median line. Fore and hind limbs present, the latter ambulatory and larger than those in front; head of femur at right angles to condyles; tibia with procnemial crest; fibula complete. First row of tarsals composed of astragalus and calcaneum only, which together form the upper portion of ankle joint.

##### (1.) Order SAUROPODA (Lizard foot.) Herbivorous.

Feet plantigrade, ungulate; five digits in manus and pes; second row of carpals and tarsals unossified. Pubes projecting in front, and united distally by cartilage; no post-pubis. Precaudal vertebræ hollow. Fore and hind limbs nearly equal; limb bones solid. Sternal bones partial. Premaxillaries with teeth.

(1.) Family *Atlantosauridae*. Anterior vertebræ opisthocœlian. Ischia directed downward, with extremities meeting on median line.

Genera *Atlantosaurus*, *Apatosaurus*, *Brontosaurus*, *Diplodocus*, ? *Camarasaurus* (*Amphicœlias*), ? *Dystrophæus*.

(2.) Family *Morosauridae*. Anterior vertebræ opisthocœlian. Ischia directed backward, with sides meeting on median line.

Genus *Morosaurus*.

European forms of this order: *Bothriospondylus*, *Cetiosaurus*, *Chondrosteosaurus*, *Euamerotus*, *Ornithopsis*, *Pelorosaurus*.

##### (2.) Order STEGOSAURIA (Plated lizard.) Herbivorous.

Feet plantigrade, ungulate; five digits in manus and pes; second row of carpals unossified. Pubes projecting free in front; post-pubis present. Fore limbs very small; locomotion mainly on hind limbs. Vertebræ and limb bones solid. Osseous dermal armor.

(1.) Family *Stegosauridae*. Vertebræ biconcave. Neural canal in sacrum expanded into large chamber; ischia directed backward, with sides meeting on median line. Astragalus coössi-fied with tibia; metapodials very short.

Genera *Stegosaurus* (*Hypsirhophus*), *Diracodon*, and in Europe *Omosaurus*, Owen.

(2) Family *Scelidosaurida*. Astragalus not coössified with tibia; metatarsals elongated; four functional digits in pes. Known forms all European.

Genera, *Scelidosaurus*, *Acanthopholis*, *Cratæomus*, *Hylæosaurus*, *Polacanthus*.

(3.) Order ORNITHOPODA (Bird foot). Herbivorous.

Feet digitigrade, five functional digits in manus and three in pes. Pubes projecting free in front; post-pubis present. Vertebrae solid. Fore limbs small; limb bones hollow. Premaxillaries edentulous in front.

(1.) Family *Camptonotida*. Clavicles wanting; post-pubis complete.

Genera *Camptonotus*, *Laosaurus*, *Nanosaurus*, and in Europe *Hypsilophodon*.

(2.) Family *Iguanodontida*. Clavicles present; post-pubis incomplete. Premaxillaries edentulous. Known forms all European.

Genera *Iguanodon*, *Vectisaurus*.

(3.) Family *Hadrosaurida*. Teeth in several rows, forming with use a tessellated grinding surface. Anterior vertebrae opisthocœlian.

Genera *Hadrosaurus*, ? *Agathaumas*, *Cionodon*.

(4.) Order THEROPODA (Beast foot). Carnivorous.

Feet digitigrade; digits with prehensile claws. Pubes projecting downward, and coössified distally. Vertebrae more or less cavernous. Fore limbs very small; limb bones hollow. Premaxillaries with teeth.

(1.) Family *Megalosaurida*. Vertebrae biconcave. Pubes slender, and united distally. Astragalus with ascending process. Five digits in manus and four in pes.

Genera *Megalosaurus* (*Poikilopleuron*), from Europe. *Allosaurus*, *Cælosaurus*, *Creosaurus*, *Dryptosaurus* (*Lælaps*).

(2.) Family *Zanclodontida*. Vertebrae biconcave. Pubes broad elongate plates, with anterior margins united. Astragalus without ascending process; five digits in manus and pes. Known forms European.

Genera *Zanclodon*, ? *Teratosaurus*.

(3.) Family *Amphisaurida*. Vertebrae biconcave. Pubes rod-like; five digits in manus and three in pes.

Genera *Amphisaurus* (*Megadactylus*), ? *Bathygnathus*, ? *Clepsyraurus*; and in Europe, *Palæosaurus*, *Thecodontosaurus*.

(4.) Family *Labrosaurida*. Anterior vertebrae strongly opisthocœlian, and cavernous. Metatarsals much elongated. Pubes slender, with anterior margins united.

Genus *Labrosaurus*.

Sub-Order CÆLURIA (Hollow tail.)

(5.) Family *Cœlurida*. Bones of skeleton pneumatic or hollow. Anterior cervical vertebrae opisthocœlian, remainder bi-concave. Metatarsals very long and slender.

Genus *Cœlurus*.

Sub-Order COMPSOGNATHA.

(6.) Family *Compsognathida*. Anterior vertebrae opisthocœlian. Three functional digits in manus and pes. Ischia with long symphysis on median line. Only known specimen European.

Genus *Compsognathus*.

DINOSAURIA?

(5.) Order HALLOPODA (Leaping foot.) Carnivorous?

Feet digitigrade, unguiculate; three digits in pes; metatarsals greatly elongated; calcaneum much produced backward. Fore limbs very small. Vertebrae and limb bones hollow. Vertebrae biconcave.

Family *Hallopodida*.

Genus *Hallopus*.

The five orders defined above, which I had previously established for the reception of the American Jurassic Dinosaurs, appear to be all natural groups, well marked in general from each other. The European Dinosaurs from deposits of corresponding age fall readily into the same divisions, and, in some cases, admirably supplement the series indicated by the American forms. The more important remains from other formations in this country and in Europe, so far as their characters have been made out, may likewise be referred with tolerable certainty to the same orders.

The three orders of Herbivorous Dinosaurs, although widely different in their typical forms, show, as might be expected, indications of approximation in some of their aberrant genera. The *Sauropoda*, for example, with *Atlantosaurus* and *Brontosaurus*, of gigantic size, for their most characteristic members, have in *Morosaurus* a branch leading toward the *Stegosauria*. The latter order, likewise, although its type genus is in many

respects the most strongly marked division of the Dinosaurs, has in *Scelidosaurus* a form with some features pointing strongly toward the *Ornithopoda*.

The Carnivorous *Dinosauria* now best known may all be placed at present in a single order, and this is widely separated from those that include the herbivorous forms. The two sub-orders defined include very aberrant forms, which show many points of resemblance to Mesozoic Birds. Among the more fragmentary remains belonging in this order, but not included in the present classification, this resemblance appears to be carried much farther.

The order *Hallopoda*, which I have here referred to the *Dinosauria*, with doubt, differs from all the known members of that group in having the hind feet especially adapted for leaping, the metatarsals being half as long as the tibia, and the calcaneum produced far backward. This difference in the tarsus, however, is not greater than may be found in a single order of Mammals, and is no more than might be expected in a sub-class of Reptiles.

Among the families included in the present classification, I have retained three named by Huxley (*Scelidosauridae*, *Iguanodontidae*, and *Megalosauridae*),\* although their limits as here defined are somewhat different from those first given. The sub-order *Compsognatha*, also, was established by that author in the same memoir, which contains all the more important facts then known in regard to the *Dinosauria*. With the exception of the *Hadrosauridae*, named by Cope, the other families above described were established by the writer.

The *Amphisauridae* and the *Zanclodontidae*, the most generalized families of the *Dinosauria*, are only known from the Trias. The genus *Dystrophæus*, referred provisionally to the *Sauropoda*, is likewise from deposits of that age. The typical genera, however, of all the orders and suborders are Jurassic forms, and on these especially the present classification is based. The *Hadrosauridae* are the only family confined to the Cretaceous. Above this formation, there appears to be at present no satisfactory evidence of the existence of any *Dinosauria*.

\* Quarterly Journal Geological Society of London. Vol. xxvi, p. 34. 1870.